

# ECONOMIC ANTHROPOLOGY

Sponsored by a Grant TÁMOP-4.1.2-08/2/A/KMR-2009-0041

Course Material Developed by Department of Economics,  
Faculty of Social Sciences, Eötvös Loránd University Budapest (ELTE)

Department of Economics, Eötvös Loránd University Budapest

Institute of Economics, Hungarian Academy of Sciences

Balassi Kiadó, Budapest



Authors: Tamás Dombos, Viola Zentai

Supervised by Viola Zentai

June 2011

## Week 5

# Material culture, system of alienable and inalienable goods

## The social life of things

- Appadurai (1986)
- Meanings of objects are assigned by people
- “Methodological commodity fetishism”:
  - “biography of commodities”: through that one can investigate social relations
- ≈ analysis of commodity chains
  - geography, economics
  - added value ⇔ movements across the regimes of value
- Barter ⇔ commodity; commodity ⇔ gift emphasised too much
- Key is the exchange: makes commodities circulate

## Circulation of commodities

- Commodity ⇔ commodity situation
  - it is not the property of object but generated by the social environment that surrounds it
  - commodity situation: its capability of being exchanged is social relevant
  - it is dynamic: objects move in and out of commodity situation
- Commodity phase
  - the chapter in the biography of the object in which it is a commodity (e.g. wedding ring in the jewellery shop which steps out of its commodity phase when given out)
- Commodity candidacy
  - rules of symbolic categorization that assign value to objects (e.g. Sahlins)
- Commodity context
  - social locations that facilitate the turn of objects to commodities (e.g. bazaar, heritage)

## Regimes of values

- The movement of commodities between different cultural contexts
  - varying cultures
  - varying social groups
- Participants of exchange do not value the objects in the same way
  - overlapping values are rare: tensions
- Regimes of values
  - overlapping visions of values and circulations
  - exchange: parties belong to different regimes of values
  - corresponds to different degrees of regulations in gift exchanges

## Oriental rugs

- Spooner (1986)
- Incessant Western demand for oriental rugs since the 19th century
- Luxury ⇨ mass goods:
  - exclusivity ⇨ authenticity
- What is the source of authenticity?
  - objective properties cannot explain it
  - subjective experience: the more distant, the better
  - distance: lack of information
    - ⇨ the role of mediators



## Value generated by irregularities

- Esperanza (2008)
- Market of ethnic art
- Value – knowledge: mediators' role is crucial
- Bali woodcraft artists contracted to make Christmas tree decorations designed by American wholesaler
- Several hundreds of copies of irregularities: uneven dye
  - ink stains believed to be part of the proper design
- Consumers highly appreciated the outcome:
  - American retail trader: the stains have symbolic meanings (referring to gods Ram, Vishnu, Shiva), in the spirit of Hindi-Christian dialogue



## The politics of value

- Value: not only meanings but power relations across groups
- Socially determined paths:
  - who can trade, with what and with whom?
  - “commodity enclaves”: e.g. royal monopoly
- ⇔ innovative diversions motivated by competition
  - mobility of goods (flow between regimes of values)
    - ⇔ social mobility
- Tournaments of value:
  - status fight among those who are incumbent (e.g. *kula*, stock exchange)
- Goods and knowledge:
  - power based on limiting knowledge on commodities
  - knowledge on production
  - knowledge on proper consumption

## Commodification

- To what extent is it pertinent to society that:
  - objects are in commodity phase?
  - fulfil requirements of commodity candidacy?
  - they appear in commodity contexts?
- commodification is most advanced in capitalism but all societies embrace a certain amount of commodification
- withdrawal from commodity phase (decommodification) : maintaining social prestige (e.g. regulated paths)
- Koptyoff (1986):
  - economy: commodification ⇔ culture: decommodification

# Property

- Network of social relations governing conduct of people with respect to use and disposition of things (Hoebel 1966)
- Social and cultural plurality:
  - exclusive private property is only one type of ownership, which is not the general model of property
  - in most societies some form of private property exist (including the most egalitarian ones – Woodburn 1982)
- Examining property on two levels:
  - micro: building identity through possessing objects
  - macro: control over the distribution of material goods

## The complex nature of property

- Bundle of rights (Maine 1861):
  - the entitlement to use, lease, sell, etc.
- Estates of administration (Gluckman 1965):
  - system of transferring bundle of rights in a particular political hierarchy
  - dynamic approach
- Layers (F & B Benda-Beckmann 1999):
  - cultural-ideological
  - legal-institutional
  - social
  - practice

## Property in socialist system

- Cultural-ideological
  - Marxist critique of the concept of private property: the primacy of state ownership
- Legal-institutional
  - Civil Codes: collective (social), private, and personal property
- Social relations
  - women in the countryside (industrialised agriculture)
- Practice
  - second economy, household farms, small collective entrepreneurship within the socialist industrial firms
- Estates of administration:
  - collectivization: inalienable collective property but with shares/dividends for the members
  - significance of social networks

## Property in postsocialism

- Transition: economy based on state property  $\Leftrightarrow$  private property
- “fuzzy property” (Verdery 1999)
  - privatisation is not a one-directional path
  - overlapping rights, obligations, claims
  - lack of unambiguous rules, practices
  - Romanian village in the middle of the 1990s
    - transformation of collectives to ‘associations’
    - restitution: owners cannot and do not want to cultivate the land
    - lease of land: to the association; former property rights by limited control (e.g. say in what to cultivate but not in quantity of production)
  - economic uncertainties: obligations and claims

# Private and collective property

- Critique of the concept of the prime efficiency of private property in all circumstances
- Tragedy of the commons:
  - for the individual, it is rational to overuse the common, yet everybody loses in the collective (game theory: prisoner's dilemma)
  - solution: private property
- Practice of efficient and sustainable collective properties:
  - collective property  $\neq$  open access
  - local collective control, selective transfer of information

## References

Appadurai, Arjun (1986) "Commodities and the politics of value." In Arjun Appadurai (ed.) *The Social Life of Things. Commodities in Cultural Perspectives*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 3–63.

von Benda-Beckmann, F. and K. von Benda-Beckmann (1999) "A functional analysis of property rights, with special reference to Indonesia." In T. van Meijl and F. von Benda-Beckmann (eds.) *Property rights and economic development: land and natural resources in southeast Asia and Oceania*. London: Kegan Paul International. 15–56.

Esperanza, Jennifer S. (2008). "Outsourcing otherness: Crafting and marketing culture in the global handicrafts market." In Donald Wood (ed.) *Hidden Hands in the Market: Ethnographies of Fair Trade, Ethical Consumption, and Corporate Social Responsibility* (Research in Economic Anthropology 28). 71–95.

Gluckman, Max (1965) *The ideas in Barotse jurisprudence*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press.



Hoebel, E Adamson (1966) *Anthropology: the study of man*. New York, McGraw-Hill.

Kopytoff, Igor (1986) "The Cultural Biography of Things: commoditization as process." In Arjun Appadurai (ed.) *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 64–94.

Maine, Henry J. S. (1861) *Ancient law*. London: John Murray.

Spooner, B. (1986) "Weavers and Dealers: The Authenticity of an Oriental Carpet." In Arjun Appadurai (ed.) *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 195–235.

Verdery, Katherine (1999) "Fuzzy Property: Rights, Power, and Identity in Transylvania's Decollectivization." In Michael Burawoy and Katherine Verdery (eds.) *Uncertain Transition*. Boulder: Rowman and Littlefield. 53–81.

Woodburn, J. (1982) "Egalitarian societies." In *Man*, New Series, Volume 17, Issue 3. 431–51.